



A PLATFORM FOR STAKEHOLDERS IN AFRICAN FORESTRY

# FOREST LAW ENFORCEMENT, GOVERNANCE AND TRADE IN SUB-HUMID WEST AFRICA



AFRICAN FOREST FORUM WORKING PAPER SERIES

VOLUME 1

ISSUE 2, 2011

Copyright © African Forest Forum 2011. All rights reserved. African Forest Forum P.O. Box 30677 00100  
Nairobi GPO KENYA Tel: +254 20 7224203 Fax: +254 20 722 4001 Website: [www.afforum.org](http://www.afforum.org)

Correct citation: Popoola, L. 2011. Forest Law Enforcement and Governance and Trade in Sub-Humid West Africa. African Forest Forum, Working Paper Series, Vol. (1)2, 43 pp.

Cover photo: African Forest Forum

#### Disclaimer

The designations employed and the presentation of material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the African Forest Forum concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries regarding its economic system or degree of development. Excerpts may be reproduced without authorization, on condition that the source is indicated. Views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect those of the African Forest Forum.

# Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade in sub-humid West Africa

Labode Popoola<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Centre for Sustainable Development, University of Ibadan,  
Ibadan, Nigeria.

# Table of Contents

List of Tables .....	v
Acronyms and Abbreviations .....	vi
Foreword .....	viii
Executive Summary.....	x
CHAPTER 1: Introduction.....	1
Promoting synergy and strengthening cooperation of the member states.....	2
Shared forest ecosystems .....	2
Trade in timber and forest products.....	3
Learning and sharing of experiences and best practices.....	4
CHAPTER 3: Status of Forestry .....	7
Forest goods and services and trade.....	7
Ghana.....	7
Liberia.....	8
Sierra Leone .....	9
Benin .....	10
Togo .....	10
Guinea .....	11
Côte d'Ivoire .....	12
Nigeria .....	13
Key elements of forest policy and legislation: country situation .....	13
Ghana.....	13
Liberia.....	14
Sierra Leone .....	15
Benin .....	15
Togo .....	15
Côte d'Ivoire .....	17
Nigeria .....	17

Challenges and opportunities for socioeconomic development and environmental protection in forestry .....	18
Ghana.....	18
Liberia.....	19
Sierra Leone .....	19
Benin .....	19
Togo .....	20
Guinea.....	20
Côte d'Ivoire .....	21
Nigeria .....	21
Summary at the sub-humid West Africa level.....	23
CHAPTER 4: FLEGT in sub-Humid West Africa: Causes of Illegal Forestry Related Activities .....	24
Inadequacy of forest management data .....	24
Poor marketing and pricing policies.....	24
Insufficient national capacity to control illegal logging .....	25
Lack of political will .....	25
Capacity and logistic challenges.....	25
Weak legislation and poor enforcement.....	25
CHAPITRE 5 Way Forward with FLEGT in sub-Humid West Africa .....	26
Major constraints common to West African countries.....	26
Lack of political will .....	26
Lack of national standards.....	26
Lack of a national dialogue.....	26
Lack or cost of acquisition of the necessary skills.....	26
Institutions, networks and key individuals working with issues of flegt .....	27
Conclusion.....	28
References .....	29
Annex 1: .....	32
Annex 2: .....	37

# List of Tables

Table 1: Forest extent in sub-humid West Africa in 1990 and 2005. ....	3
Table 2: Production, trade and consumption of woodfuel, roundwood and sawnwood in 2006.....	5
Table 3: Forestry sector's contribution to employment and gross domestic product in 2006.	6
Table 4: Export trade from Ghana to the rest of ECOWAS from 2005 to 2007.....	8

# Acronyms and Abbreviations

AAC	Annual Allowable Cut
AFORNET	African Forest Research Network
ANAPE	African Network for Agroforestry Education
BIVAC	Bureau Veritas
CIB	Compagnie Ivoirienne du Bois
COC	Chain of Custody
DISA	Direction de l'Informatique, des Statistiques et des Archives
DPIF	Direction de la Production et des Industries Forestières
EC	European Commission
ECOWAS	Economic Community for West African States
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
FDA	Forestry Development Authority
FDF	Federal Department of Forestry
FLEG	Forest Law Enforcement and Governance
FLEGT	Forest Law Enforcement and Governance and Trade
FMC	Forest Management contracts
FMECD	Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development
FPID	Forest Products Inspection Division
FSD	Forestry Services Division
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GFTN	Global Forest and Trade Network
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft fuer Internationale Zusammenarbeit
HULWA	Humid Lowlands of West Africa
ISPS	International Ship and Port Facility security
MAFFS	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Food Security
MINEEF	Ministère de l'Environnement des Eaux et Forêts
NaCEF	National Commission of Environment and Forestry

NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
NSA	Nouvelle Scierie d'Adzopé
NWFP	Non-Wood Forest Product
OAB	Organisation Africaine du Bois
ODEF	Office d'Exploitation des Forêts
ONAB	Office Nationale du Bois
ONUB	Office Nationale des Usagers du Bois du Bénin
PEF	Périmètre d'Exploitation Forestière
PFE	Productive Forest Estate
SGS	Société Générale de Surveillance
SIFCI	Société Industrielle et Forestière de Côte d'Ivoire
SMCI	Société de Sciage et Moulure de Côte d'Ivoire
SODEFA	Société de Développement de Fer d'Afrique
SODEFOR	Société de Développement des Forêts
STBO	Société de Transformation des Bois de l'Ouest
SYDONIA	Système Douanier Automatisé
SYGUCE	Système de Guichet Unique pour le Commerce Extérieur
TEDD	Timber Export Development Division
TIDD	Timber Industry Development Division
TSC	Timber Sales Contracts
TVA	Taxes sur Valeur Ajoutée
UN	United Nations
WD	Wildlife Division
WSSD	World Summit on Sustainable Development

# Foreword

Undoubtedly, sub-humid West Africa represents an important biome in Africa, and with a population of over 200 million people spread across eight countries, it represents an important economic block. Over the years, forest resources in the sub-region have declined increasingly, while the scope of utilisation seems to have expanded, arising mainly as a result of relative economic growth, increasing population and foreign trade. The local forest industries are however, still relatively rudimentary and largely inefficient. West African countries obviously, have not taken advantage of the enormous potentials available in the sub-region in the area of trade and human resources, particularly in the forestry sector in spite of the fact that the statutes establishing the Economic Community for West African States (ECOWAS) permits free movements of citizens, goods and services among member states. The mechanism for enhancing this appears to be very weak, where it exists, and even absent in some places. This tends to restrict integration, leading to non-optimization of the potentials inherent in regional trade. Illegal trade in forest products has thus inadvertently been encouraged and the proceeds there from do not stream into the national accounting systems.

The Forest Law Enforcement and Governance and Trade (FLEGT) initiative was initiated in 2003 by the European Commission (EU) as a comprehensive Action Plan that can set up a sustainable reform in the forestry sector, through legislation and markets and basically built upon voluntary agreements and strong commitment of producer countries. In furtherance of its mission and commitment to managing the African forests in sustainable manner, as well as generating and sharing knowledge and information for Sustainable Forest Management, the African Forest Forum commissioned a study covering the eight sub-humid West African countries of Benin, Ghana, Guinea Conakry, Côte d'Ivoire, Liberia, Nigeria, Sierra Leone and Togo to assess the status and performance of FLEGT and its impact on Sustainable Forest Management.

This report covers an introduction to FLEGT, status of forests in the study area, including key elements of forest policy and legislation, challenges and opportunities for socioeconomic development and environmental protection in forestry. The report also addresses the country by country status of FLEGT and proffers the way forward to optimizing the benefits of FLEGT. The report submits that timber trade and flow remain an important component of the economic systems of many West African States, yet illegal harvesting appears to be on the increase and tends to hamper the realization of full economic potential of the sector. Export procedures in many of the countries are fraught with corruption while certification is yet to be seen as being of great relevance in sustainable management of forests. Language barrier and the non-existence of a common currency have also been cited as major driving forces and would therefore, need to be addressed within the regional economic block.

This report represents a very significant contribution to the discourse on Forest Law Enforcement Governance and Trade and indeed Sustainable Forest Management in Sub-Humid West Africa and great credit should go to Professor Labode Popoola who prepared it on behalf of the African Forest Forum.



Prof. Godwin Kowero

Executive Secretary, African Forest Forum.

# Executive Summary

Deforestation and natural resources degradation are of key issues for human development and communities' well-being. Forest situation in West Africa is most challenging because of growing population, low income, weak policies, insufficient political and institutional development, political instability, conflicts and civil wars. Almost the quarter of the total forest area of West-Africa has been lost in a 15-year timeframe. Forest resources in the region consisted of protected areas, forest reserves and off-reserve forest areas, the last category being the most exploited in forestry sector.

Forestry is an important economic sector in West-Africa, providing produce for both commercial purposes and domestic uses, and should contribute to employment and gross domestic product. Unprocessed timber, timber products for primary and secondary processing, such as lumber and plywood, sawn-timber, mouldings, veneer, sawn-timber are produced for exports markets, and rough-sawn-timber, rough-sawn planks are mainly for domestic demand. Timber and wood products exports from West Africa to Europe and Asia have quadrupled between 2001 and 2007, with the partnership of trade companies and industries worldwide. In the meantime, woodfuel production for domestic uses also increased sharply. In most cases, forests have been logged under illegal and uncontrolled circumstances, including illegal chainsaw logging, corruption, poor management of institutions, lack of capacity and adequate equipment, weak legislation and regulation.

The ECOWAS offers a great potential for synergy and cooperation between producer countries, by allowing free movements for citizens, goods and services among member states, but it appears that West African countries did not take advantage of this opportunity for developing the forestry sector. As a result, illegal logging and trade continue to occur in West Africa at the highest rate, without contributing to any increase of the national revenue.

The Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade (FLEGT) was initiated in 2003 by the European Commission as a comprehensive Action Plan that can set up a sustainable reform in the forestry sector, through legislation and markets and basically built upon voluntary agreements and strong commitment of producer countries. For this initiative to be effective in West Africa there is a need to strengthen cooperation of all stakeholders, and raise more awareness about the essential role of legislation and market institutions. Certification of forest products must be recognized as a crucial asset for accessing wood markets. This last issue needs to be properly addressed through collaborative and strong networks working with matters related to forest law enforcement, trade and governance.

# CHAPTER 1 Introduction

Deforestation and degradation of natural resources have been a twin matter of concern across the globe (ITTO, 2006). The early conservation movement predicted the implication of uncontrolled logging and exploitation of natural resources to include natural disasters, reduction in the quality of life and scarcity of material for the future generation (World Bank/WWF Alliance, 2002, 2003; WWF, 2008). Since the Brutland report and the Rio Conference in 1992, even greater concerns were expressed about the state of the earth. Many of these concerns are traceable to uncontrolled logging, and in many cases illegal logging (Brack, 2009). Concern about the extent to which illegal logging has been contributing to forest loss has grown sharply since the 1980s. Successive data on the State of the World Forests published by FAO (2009) have showed progressive loss of forest. In many instances very large proportion of the timber entering both national and international markets has been accessed, harvested, transported and traded in contravention of national laws.

Overtime it has become obvious that for many countries in Africa, the institutional framework for regulating/enforcing forest governance are either too weak to address the dire situation or are even non-existent (Contreras-Hermosilla, 2002; World Bank, 2006). According to Owino and Ndinga (2004), it is important that countries address issues and concerns from the international dialogue on sustainable development, as agreed upon in Agenda 21 of the Rio Earth Summit and reaffirmed during the Johannesburg World Summit on Sustainable Development. Weak institutions and lack of political will have however made this unachievable in most of sub-Sahara Africa.

Illegal logging was first raised as a serious international problem in 1998 in the G8 foreign ministers' 'Action Programme on Forests'. In April 2002, the European Commission hosted an international workshop to discuss how the EU should combat illegal logging. At the World Summit on Sustainable Development (WSSD) held in Johannesburg in the same year, the European Commission set out a strong commitment to combat illegal logging and the associated trade in illegally harvested timber. To build on this commitment, the FLEGT Action Plan was adopted in May 2003. Forest Law Enforcement and Governance (FLEG) was therefore seen as a possible means of reversing the negative trend. The FLEG process was officially initiated by the European Union in October 2003.

# CHAPTER 2: FLEGT in sub-Humid West Africa: Background and Justification

## PROMOTING SYNERGY AND STRENGTHENING COOPERATION OF THE MEMBER STATES

The EU FLEGT initiative seeks to reform forestry governance in producer countries using market levers and legislation. This is expected to work through voluntary agreements that the producer countries will sign up to. This initiative comes after a number of interventions in producer countries to reform forest management. The FLEGT initiative comes at a time when some producer countries, assisted by “donors”, are still in transition between old and new ways of doing business. There are significant challenges to be addressed as producer countries brace themselves for another tide of reforms in this highly challenging sector – forestry. The key task however is to complete the reforms initiated by producer countries and to ensure that the forest sector can fully contribute to economic development with minimal damage to the environment (World Bank, 2006).

## SHARED FOREST ECOSYSTEMS

The FAO (2009) posits that the forest situation in Africa presents enormous challenges, reflecting the larger constraints of low income, weak policies and inadequately developed institutions. The growing population and rising prices of food and energy will exacerbate the situation, especially as increased investments in infrastructure open up new areas (USITC, 2007; Portugal-Perez and Wilson, 2008). Progress in implementing sustainable forest management is expected to be slow, with forest loss likely to continue at current rates. The forest outlook will depend greatly on political and institutional developments – on improved efficiency and accountability in the public sector; greater inclusiveness, competitiveness and transparency in market institutions; and an informal sector that provides increased livelihood opportunities for the poor. Focusing on products and services required locally and globally and strengthening local institutions can be important ways of addressing forest resource depletion. Such efforts should build on local knowledge and experience of sustainable resource management integrating agriculture, animal husbandry and forestry (Amanor, 2003).

The total area under forest in West Africa continues to decline. According to FAO (2009) the total forest area of 699.361 million ha in 1990 declined by 4.375 million ha (0.64%) by 2000

and further by another 4.040 million ha (0.62%) by the year 2005. Forest resources in the region consist of protected areas, forest reserves under direct government control and off-reserve forest areas. The last category are often on community lands where community access and utilization may be permitted subject to government requirements being observed, or under private ownership, which is largely the case for rubber plantations. The estimated extent of forest area in the region is over 42 million ha (FAO, 2006), but in the period from 1990 to 2005 it is estimated that an average of almost 21% of forest was lost. Only in Ivory Coast has there been any area increase, presumably as a result of plantation development. Forest area figures for 2005 and forest loss from 1990 to 2005 are shown in Table 1.

**Table 1: Forest extent in sub-humid West Africa in 1990 and 2005.**

Country	Forest area (103 ha)		Forest area as % of total area	
	1990	2005	1990	2005
<b>Nigeria</b>	17,234	11,089	35.7	12.2
<b>Côte d’Ivoire</b>	10,222	10,405	1.8	32.7
<b>Guinea</b>	7,408	6,724	9.2	27.4
<b>Ghana</b>	7,448	5,517	25.9	24.2
<b>Liberia</b>	4,058	3,154	22.3	32.7
<b>Sierra Leone</b>	3,044	2,754	9.5	38.5
<b>Benin</b>	3,322	2,351	29.2	21.3
<b>Togo</b>	685	386	43.6	7.1

Source: Adapted from FAO (2006).

## TRADE IN TIMBER AND FOREST PRODUCTS

West African member states are basically main producers and consumers of woodfuel, industrial roundwood and sawnwood with little or no imports and exports. The general trend of the production of woodfuel, industrial roundwood and sawnwood indicates that Nigeria ranks the highest while Sierra Leone ranks the least (Table 2). For the import and export, almost all the countries consume what they produce for woodfuel. Meanwhile, few volumes of the produced industrial roundwood and sawnwood were exported and imported by the member states with Ivory Coast having the highest volume for export of industrial roundwood and sawnwood.

For the processed wood products, there is enormous potential for trade in timber and forest products and employment in the sub-region (Table 3). Regarding forestry sector's contribution to employment, Nigeria has the highest contribution to employment in roundwood production, and pulp and paper while Ghana has the highest contribution for wood processing. In terms of gross value addition, Nigeria has the highest US\$ contribution of roundwood production and pulp and paper production while Ghana has the highest contribution for the wood processing. For the overall forestry sector's contribution to GDP, Liberia contributed the highest followed by Ghana while this was least in Nigeria.

## LEARNING AND SHARING OF EXPERIENCES AND BEST PRACTICES

It is obvious that West African countries have not taken advantage of the enormous potentials available in the sub-region in the area of trade and human resources, particular in the forestry sector. Even though the statutes establishing the Economic Community for West African States (ECOWAS) permits the freedom of movements of citizens, goods and services among member states, the mechanism for enhancing this appears to be very weak, where it exists, and even absent in some places. This tends to restrict trade, leading to non-optimization of the potentials inherent in regional trade. Consequently, illegal trade is encouraged and the proceeds there from do not stream into the national accounting system. Language barrier and the non-existence of a common currency have also been cited as major driving forces and would therefore need to be addressed within the regional economic block.

**Table 2: Production, trade and consumption of woodfuel, roundwood and sawnwood in 2006**

Countries	Woodfuel (10 <sup>3</sup> m <sup>3</sup> )				Industrial roundwood (10 <sup>3</sup> m <sup>3</sup> )				Sawnwood (10 <sup>3</sup> m <sup>3</sup> )			
	Prod	Imp	Exp	Cons	Prod	Imp	Exp	Cons	Prod	Imp	Exp	Cons
<b>Benin</b>	6 101	0	0	6 101	332	0	13	319	31	9	18	21
<b>Ghana</b>	33040	0	0	33040	1304	3	1	1305	527	0	210	317
<b>Guinea</b>	11738	0	0	11738	651	1	23	629	10	0	9	2
<b>Côte d'Ivoire</b>	8740	0	0	8740	1347	10	142	1215	420	0	381	39
<b>Liberia</b>	6033	0	0	6033	300	0	0	300	60	0	1	59
<b>Nigeria</b>	61629	0	1	61628	9 418	1	42	9 377	2000	1	22	1980
<b>Sierra Leone</b>	5448	0	0	5448	124	0	1	123	5	1	0	6
<b>Togo</b>	5816	0	0	5816	166	0	8	158	14	4	5	14

**Source:** FAO (2009). Prod = Production, Imp = Imports, Exp = Exports, Cons = Consumption

**Table 3: Forestry sector's contribution to employment and gross domestic product in 2006**

Country	Employment					Gross value added				
	Roundwood Production (10 <sup>3</sup> )	Wood Processing (10 <sup>3</sup> )	Pulp and Paper (10 <sup>3</sup> )	Total for the forestry sector		Roundwood Production (US\$ 10 <sup>6</sup> )	Wood Processing (US\$ 10 <sup>6</sup> )	Pulp and paper (US\$ 10 <sup>6</sup> )	Total for the forestry sector	
				(10 <sup>3</sup> )	(% of total labour force)				(US\$ 10 <sup>6</sup> )	(% GDP)
<b>Benin</b>	1	0	–	1	0.0	103	5	0	108	2.6
<b>Ghana</b>	12	30	1	43	0.4	542	202	10	754	7.2
<b>Guinea</b>	9	1	–	10	0.2	39	6	–	45	1.7
<b>Côte d'Ivoire</b>	19	8	1	28	0.4	672	96	33	801	5.0
<b>Liberia</b>	1	1	–	2	0.1	113	9	–	121	17.7
<b>Nigeria</b>	24	3	18	45	0.1	1 506	32	282	1 819	1.4
<b>Sierra Leon</b>	0	0	0	1	0.0	84	0	0	85	4.8
<b>Togo</b>	1	0	–	1	0.0	31	2	–	33	1.6

Source: FAO (2009).

# CHAPTER 3: Status of Forestry

## FOREST GOODS AND SERVICES AND TRADE

### Ghana

Forestry and timber industries are of major importance to Ghana's economy (VPA, 2005). As indicated by Blackett and Gardette (2008) in the report on cross-border flows of timber and wood products in West Africa, timber products have consistently been the third highest value export commodity after cocoa and gold in Ghana. From 2001 to 2005, official exports accounted for between 7 and 10% of export earnings. The average annual value was about US\$180 million from 2005 to 2007. Timber products are supplied from Ghana to neighbouring countries, mainly lumber to the Sahel region and plywood to Nigeria. Much of the trade to the Sahel is based on illegal chainsaw logging and export is reported by the Forestry Commission to be conducted with little formality and control. Forestry Commission data indicates that lumber exports to the Sahel were about 38,000 m<sup>3</sup> in 2007 but local observers suggest that the trade is far greater and that the annual volume is more likely to be in the region of 300,000 m<sup>3</sup>, which would be on average in the order of 40 lorry or container loads per day.

The officially reported figures for exports to ECOWAS from 2005 to 2007 are shown in Table 4. The growing importance to Nigeria of Ghana as a source of timber products is clearly evident with exports more than tripling from 2005 to 2007. Reported trade with Benin, Togo and Nigeria in 2007 amounted to about 84,000 m<sup>3</sup> and was almost entirely plywood. It is believed that further volumes of lumber are traded with these countries but no estimates are available. The plywood trade with Nigeria was worth €22.4 million compared with European Union imports of about €3.0 million (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

**Table 4: Export trade from Ghana to the rest of ECOWAS from 2005 to 2007.**

Country	2005		2006		2007	
	Volume (m <sup>3</sup> )	Value (US\$ 10 <sup>6</sup> )	Volume (m <sup>3</sup> )	Value (US\$ 10 <sup>6</sup> )	Volume (m <sup>3</sup> )	Value (US\$ 10 <sup>6</sup> )
<b>Nigeria</b>	22,460	8.43	61,240	24.44	74,540	30.71
<b>Senegal</b>	22,420	6.70	14,760	4.31	12,820	4.14
<b>Niger</b>	880	0.10	10,340	2.24	16,360	3.07
<b>Togo</b>	480	0.20	4,570	1.51	6,670	2.64
<b>Burkina Faso</b>	80	0.02	6,190	2.34	8,280	2.04
<b>Benin</b>	80	0.02	4,390	1.07	2,500	0.63
<b>Gambia</b>	1,610	0.51	1,250	0.36	700	0.22
<b>Sierra Leone</b>	170	0.04	60	0.00	110	0.04
<b>Mali</b>					240	0.03
<b>Total</b>	48,180	16.04	102,800	36.30	122,420	43.51

## Liberia

Liberia is considered as one of the globally important hot spots of biodiversity (Zakharenka, 2006). The country has two major blocks of less disturbed rainforest of Upper Guinean forests (Parren and Reitze de Graaf, 1995). Considering the extend of forest loss in the other countries of the sub-region, the forests of Liberia are regarded as present-day refuge (Eben, 2003; Blundell, 2008) and represent the most substantial existing areas of the Upper Guinean biogeographical zone (MacKinnon and MacKinnon, 1986).

According to FDA (2002) there are 2.4 million ha of closed dense forest in Liberia and a further 1.0 million ha of open dense forest which in total amounts to about 36% of the land area. FAO (2006) records a loss of forest area from 1990 to 2005 of 22.3%. There has been no comprehensive forest inventory since the 1960s when extractable commercial timber volume was estimated to be 3.2 million m<sup>3</sup> per annum (FAO, 2004). Currently the general view is that logging activities both before and during the conflicts have caused serious degradation and it is generally believed that the sustainable annual harvest should not be more than 800,000 m<sup>3</sup>.

The principal forestry activity in Liberia has always been logging with minimal development of timber processing industries. Exports were negligible during the mid-1990s but began to expand sharply towards the end of the decade and in 2000 the forestry sector contributed

about \$100 million to the total gross domestic product of US\$450 million (Greenpeace, 2002).

Timber trade is a major business in Liberia. From 1996 to 1999 average log production was about 150,000 m<sup>3</sup> but increased sharply in 2000 when production and export volumes were about 896,000 and 626,000 m<sup>3</sup> respectively. In 1995 almost 100% of exports were to France but by 2000 China had entered the market and accounted for about 50% of the trade, with Europe consuming about 40%, of which 17% was to France. By 2003 China was buying more than 60% of all exports and, with French exports dropping to less than 20%, was by far the most significant trade partner. Until the timber export ban in 2003, Liberian exports to Europe were second only to the Ivory Coast in volume, but given that there was very limited added value through processing, only a third in value was realized. In 2000 and 2001 the export trade to Europe was valued at just over US\$64 million. The domestic market consumes large volumes of low-grade, rough-sawn-timber derived from chainsaw logging operations but figures are hard to find. Although accurate data are lacking it was assumed that timber export revenues for 2002 were at least US\$146 million and possibly as much as US\$180 to 200 million (United Nations Security Council, 2003).

In 2003, in response to protracted civil wars between 1989 and 1996 and again from 1999 to 2003, the UN imposed a timber export ban because of the lack of any effective forest authority and in an effort to curtail financing of illegal arms trafficking linked to continuing instability in Liberia and in neighbouring Ivory Coast and Sierra Leone. The ban was lifted in 2006 when Liberia was judged to have met UN conditions requiring forest sector reform (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

## Sierra Leone

The FAO (2006) reports that Sierra Leone has about 2.8 million ha of forest, which at 38.5% of the land area, is the highest proportion within the sub-region. There is no differentiation between forest types and much of this could be savannah with the high forest concentrated in eastern part of the country. The closed high forest is thought to extend to 635,000 ha and secondary forest to about 260,000 ha. Loss of forest from 1990 to 2005 was estimated at about 300,000 ha or 9.5%. Forest reserves and protected forests cover about 400,000 ha with additional forest being located on private and community lands.

Forestry and timber industries are not a major component of Sierra Leone's economy. The average value of timber exports to Europe in 2004 and 2005 was only €110,000, whereas, for the year ending October 2005, exports of all products was recorded as \$158 million (US Department of State, 2008).

## Benin

The FAO (2006) reported that Benin has about 2.3 million ha of forest which is 21% of the total land area and includes savannah woodland of limited commercial potential. Productive forests include 351,000 ha in the protected forests of Agoua, Mount Kouffè and Wari-Marò, and a teak plantation of 14,000 ha in Bohicon. Forest is now being lost at annual rate of 70,000 ha (2.3 %) per year through bush fires and forest clearance. The main timber species, iroko, samba and antiaris, are diminishing and other species now harvested include lingue and false-teak. Benin has never been an important country for the timber trade but it was self-sufficient and able to meet local demand for sawn-timber, poles and firewood (FAO, 2001).

As indicated by Blackett and Gardette (2008), Benin has developed large teak plantations, with the German Technical Cooperation (GTZ) assistance, and has maintained large protected forests under management plans. The country has around 36,000 ha of teak plantations, some dating from the 1950s and 1960s. Some teak from these plantations is exported to Southeast Asia. The state-run company, National Agency of Wood [Office National du Bois (ONAB)], manages about 60% of the plantation area, the remainder being privately managed. In 2000 and 2001, approximately 31,000 m<sup>3</sup> of teak logs were produced from ONAB plantations per annum. The forest sector contribution to GDP is estimated to be about 3 %. Benin's forest industry, although small by international standards, is of great importance nationally because of the income and employment it provides in rural areas, and the supply of much-needed timber to the domestic market. It also earns a moderate amount of foreign exchange. Unfortunately, natural forest areas are being seriously overexploited and there is little effective control of the widespread illegal activity.

## Togo

Togo has never been an important country for timber trade and has always suffered shortages of timber for construction and furniture manufacture (Blackett and Gardette, 2008). Togo has a total forest cover of 510,000 ha, about 15,000 ha under teak plantations, of which 60% are in public ownership and 40% are private, and 12,000 ha of Eucalyptus, one-third state-owned and two-thirds privately owned (PEP, 2007). Since 1999, of the 83 protected forests, initially covering 800,000 ha, half have been completely converted to agriculture and the remaining half are degraded and occupied by villagers. The country has an estimated productive forest estate (PFE) of about 368,000 ha, comprising 41,000 ha of natural production forest, 313,000 ha of protection forest and 14,000 ha of plantations (and additional private plantations outside the PFE). At least 5,500 ha of natural-forest production are considered to be managed sustainably.

The national statistics division records average timber exports of 5,600 tonnes per year, which increased sharply to 9,700 tonnes in 2005, most probably because of teak in transit from Ivory Coast. Limited volumes are exported to Europe, with exports to Italy, France,

Germany and Spain amounting to 1,665 tonnes, mostly secondary products including mouldings (50%) and sawn-timber (30%). The main export is of teak logs directly to India. Veneer and sawn-timber are exported to the ECOWAS countries of Benin, Burkina Faso, Ivory Coast and Niger. In 2007, total annual imports were over 20,000 tonnes, of which Ghana supplies the majority at 10,000 tonnes. Benin supplies about 1,200 tonnes and the remainder comes from Ivory Coast or Nigeria. No plywood is produced in Togo and imports include both plywood and lumber for construction (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

Having very little forest, Togo obtains timber raw material from Ghana and Benin. Species supplied are iroko, samba, sapele and false-teak. Ghana was one of the main suppliers of wood to Togo. Trade in new species such as teak or false-teak in recent years with Indian and Chinese buyers has fostered the export of raw material and reduced the size of local processing industries. Lomé Port is a free-port and, with limited controls exercised, has facilitated the transit or export of many products from the West African region during conflicts (e.g. containerized teak from rebel held areas in Ivory Coast). Timber statistics are difficult to evaluate as there is no real coordination between the different administrations of forestry, customs and port to provide consistent data on either the formal or informal timber trade (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

## Guinea

Guinea Conakry has four very diverse regions: the 'Guinée Maritime' with the largest mangrove forests in West Africa; the 'Moyenne Guinée' close to Gambia and Senegal; the 'Haute-Guinée' with savannah and open forest; and the 'Guinée Forestière' which is dense forest around Mount Nimba. The forest covers about 6.7 million ha, but the timber potential is unevenly distributed. Some less populated zones like the 'Guinée Maritime', excluding Conakry, have capacity for charcoal production and the 'Moyenne and Haute Guinée', where pasture is dominant, still have some timber species (afzelia, iroko, lingue, mahogany and false-teak). In 'Guinée Forestière' the former forest cover of 1 million ha has been dramatically reduced to about 312,000 ha because of several concomitant factors: settlement of refugees from Sierra Leone, Liberia and Ivory Coast in densely forested areas; over-logging; and slash-and-burn agriculture. There are some scattered plantations of teak and local species. In 'Guinée Forestière' there are six protected forests [Forêts Classées]: Ziama, Diécké, Mont Béro, Pic de Fon, Yonon and Banan covering 260,000 ha of former logging reserves (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

Guinea Conakry is an important mining country with substantial reserves of tin, iron, diamond, platinum and gold. Timber resources have therefore not been previously intensively exploited, and timber industries are a recent development. There are no long-term operators. Many operators are mining companies, which before exploitation of mineral resources, opportunistically log the forest and export the logs without any processing. They are not licensed for timber production but are authorized to excavate below ground level.

Since 1999 many logging permits have been issued, mostly to foreign logging companies but these were cancelled or not renewed after 2002 (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

## Côte d'Ivoire

Ivory Coast still has 10.4 million ha of forest and this has increased by 1.8% between 1990 and 2005. According to the Department of Informatics, Statistics and Archives [Direction de l'Informatique, des Statistiques et des Archives (DISA)], forest areas amount to 14 million ha, (four million ha of protected forest and 168,000 ha of plantations, mostly teak) (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

Like in most other West African countries, timber flows in Ivory Coast lack good records. Internal wood derives from chainsaw logging in teak plantations, protected forests and conservation forests (Tai National Park). The local market is supplied with rough-sawn planks, with whitewood used for construction and redwoods for the furniture industry. Ivory Coast exports to the European Union (EU) include sawn-timber (62%) and veneer (22.5%). Official exports to Italy, Spain, Germany, France, UK, Ireland and Portugal account for 67% by value and 51% by volume, which was reported to be 355,832 m<sup>3</sup> in 2007, compared to EU recorded imports of 255,000 tonnes. Exports, to Mauritania, Tunisia, Burkina Faso, Mali and Senegal, account for 13.5% by value and 15% by volume, mainly plywood and air-dried lumber. Overland exports do not take into account trade by the informal sector of minimally processed timber to other ECOWAS countries. The emerging markets of India, Malaysia, China, Taiwan and Thailand account for a high volume (30%) and a low value (15%). India is the leading destination for teak poles and lumber with minimal processing. China, the leading buyer of false-teak, buys mostly squared logs or sliced veneer (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

A large timber processing industry developed in Ivory Coast because of the extensive forest resources and good road infrastructure and energy supplies. Most companies have either logging concessions or manage protected forests under the SODEFOR management plan. The Main companies (e.g. CIB, Inprobois, SIFCI, SMCI, STBO, Thanry and Tropical Bois) account for 80% of log harvesting and timber processing (DISA, undated). All the industries have sawmills, 30% produce rotary veneer and 10% produce sliced veneer. The last two activities have increased during the last two years from 22 to 30% and 8 to 10%, respectively. In 2006, primary processing (sawn-timber, rotary-cut veneer and sliced veneer) accounted for 700,000 m<sup>3</sup> of output and secondary processing (plywood, mouldings, flooring and builders' joinery) accounted for 132,000 m<sup>3</sup>. Production of sawn-timber is decreasing while rotary cut veneer is increasing. Secondary processing is now sharply increasing (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

## Nigeria

Forestry and timber industries were formerly extensive and of major importance in Nigeria. Lumber and plywood was produced for both domestic and export markets. For over 30 years, as a result of resource depletion, the sector has been in decline. Industrial round wood export in 1964 was 781,200 m<sup>3</sup>, but by 1976 this had dropped to 26,900 m<sup>3</sup>. Nigeria has now banned the export of indigenous species logs and rough-sawn lumber.

The FAO (2006) reported that Nigeria has about 11.0 million ha of forest which is 12% of the total land area and largely savannah woodland with limited commercial potential except for the highly destructive production of charcoal. Forest reserves total 9.6 million ha but 75% of this is located in the savannah zone and only 2.0 million ha in the high forest zone (FAO, 2003). The Federal Department of Forestry (FDF) estimates that about 975,000 ha of forest reserves are productive and another 2.3 million ha of off-reserve forests which are located on privately owned or community land are partially productive.

With an estimated population of about 140 million, Nigeria has an enormous domestic demand for construction and joinery timber. In regional and international markets, Nigeria's principal relevance is in the context of its internal requirements. Nigeria is now a net importer of timber. Timber exports to Europe from 2001 to 2006 were reasonably constant with an average annual value of just under US\$32 million but in 2007 less than US\$14 million was in timber exports, the balance being charcoal. Already there is enormous internal demand for fuelwood and charcoal. Exports to Europe have nearly quadrupled from 22,000 tonnes in 2001 to 85,000 tonnes in 2007 (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

## KEY ELEMENTS OF FOREST POLICY AND LEGISLATION: COUNTRY SITUATION

### Ghana

The public sector of the forest industry has undergone considerable reform in the past three years. The Ministry of Lands and Forestry is responsible for policy development while the executive agency is the Forestry Commission. The latter comprises three divisions: the Forestry Services Division (FSD), the Timber Industry Development Division (TIDD) (formerly comprising the Forest Products Inspection Division (FPID) and the Timber Export Development Division (TEDD)) and the Wildlife Division (WD). Institutional development has been taking place for many years with donor support and a range of institutional structures are in place. The Divisions of the Forestry Commission are funded largely by royalty payments and a 2% levy on the value of exports.

In recent times, Ghana has adopted a new emphasis on plantation development and a more market-based approach to the allocation of concessions. The Timber Resources

Management Act (Act 547) is the main piece of legislation that governs the use of forest resources. Although forest policy dates back to 1994, it is still regarded as broadly valid. However, strategies to deliver policy are being change; progress continues to be made in legislation, for example to allow more transparent bidding for timber concessions.

Chiefs, who are advised by their traditional councils, own most of the land in Ghana. There is a network of Forest Reserves, dating from colonial times, managed on the Chief's behalf by the Forestry Commission. Timber is harvested from both inside and outside forest reserves. Outside the forest reserves, the Chiefs control the allocation of trees for harvesting, and although an inventory process is required of the trees to be cut, it is often rudimentary. Inside the forest reserves, harvesting is better controlled and trees are individually marked for harvest after a stock inventory process controlled by the Forestry Commission.

Enforcement of forest regulations is the responsibility of the Forestry Commission through the Forest Services Division (FSD) and the Timber Industry Development Division (TIDD). The Forest Services Division is responsible for management, inventory and harvesting of the resource, including measuring trees after they have been felled and monitoring how much royalty should be paid. Royalties are calculated on the whole volume of the harvested trees, irrespective of how much is actually extracted. The TIDD monitors the transport and utilisation of logs and other wood products and exports of processed wood. They mount road checkpoints and send teams into log yards to check that logs are correctly marked and have not been transported illegally.

## **Liberia**

The Forest Development Authority (FDA) is charged with the responsibility of managing Liberia's forests in both forest reserves and off-reserve. In the past logging was based on allocation of concessions to logging companies mainly through patronage and nepotism. A concession committee instituted in 2004 recommended that all previous concession agreements be declared null and void by the President (Rochow et al., 2007; Woods et al., 2008). This recommendation was implemented in 2006. As indicated by Blackett and Gardette (2008) in their report on cross-border flows of timber and wood products in West Africa, reforms now being implemented are that Timber Sales Contracts (TSCs) or Forest Management Contracts (FMCs) will be awarded in Liberia by competitive tender. The TSCs was indicated to cover small areas of about 5,000 ha in off-reserve areas, which are destined for conversion to agriculture, have tenure of three years and will be awarded to companies having at least 51% Liberian ownership. The FMCs was also indicated to cover areas from 50,000 to 400,000 ha, which are intended for long-term sustainable management. Tenure will be 25 years and, if the area is greater than 100,000 ha, may be awarded to foreign companies (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

## Sierra Leone

Responsibility for the forestry sector is vested in the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Food Security (MAFFS) with executive management by the Forestry Division, although there is no formal clarification of this as a previous regime shifted responsibility for environment and forestry to the newly created National Commission of Environment and Forestry (NaCEF).

Since January 2008 all concession operations were suspended and logging banned because of concerns about environmental degradation. New guidelines have been prepared for issue of logging permits and there were rumours that recommencement of permit issue is imminent. The guidelines cover logging in community forests or forest reserves of less than 26 km<sup>2</sup>, which can be approved by the Minister, and larger forest reserves, which require cabinet approval.

## Benin

The Conformity Certificate describes the timber species, wood origin and type of processed products which have to be checked by a forest officer. The Conformity Certificate is required before an Export Statement is issued by the Ministry of Forests. Some products may be specifically inspected to verify that phyto-sanitary requirements are met. The Export Statement contains a description of the exported wood and financial details including the bill of consignment and letter of credit required to demonstrate that payment will be made to a local bank. Customs officers will conduct a final check and issue a temporary or permanent loading statement permitting products to be loaded into a container for export but there is no effective timber tracking system in operation in Benin (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

The National Association of Wood Users (ANUB), a timber trade association, has a great influence and controls the production and trade of forest products in Benin. A state-owned teak mill, Saclo, in Bohicon, is managed by ONAB for production of lumber, veneer, flooring and moulding, but although supported by (GTZ) since 1983, it is poorly run with the management unchanged for ten years. The mill operates for only four days in a week. Some of the equipment, including kiln driers, is non-operational or not well-maintained (Blackett and Gardette, 2008).

## Togo

The Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources is in charge of forests in Togo. The Forestry Office [Office d'Exploitation des Forêts (ODEF)] being in charge of state-owned plantations, has the duty to provide teak or Eucalyptus logs and lumber to local timber yards in Lomé and elsewhere. Better prices offered by Indian buyers have strongly influenced ODEF policy, which prioritizes direct export of teak to India rather than supplying the local market. The effects are, first, the annual harvesting plan is not adhered to and secondly, the

plantations are becoming less well managed. Because ODEF is not providing teak to local timber traders or the local timber processing industries, most are inactive and have had to close down, sawmills in particular. Furniture manufacturers work periodically when timber is available. Many of the industries in Togo are small family businesses with little interest in issues of legality in either harvesting or trade.

## Guinea

As indicated in the report on cross-border flows of timber and wood products in West Africa (Blackett and Gardette, 2008), customs are implementing a new computerized system, SYDONIA, to support checking operations with the European Commission (EC) funding support and assistance. As with most of the West African ports, the introduction of new security measures under the International Maritime Organization's International Ship and Port Facility Security Code (the ISPS Code) is slow and informal trade activities continue to be favoured. Export documents required are the conformity certificate describing timber species, origin and product type, an export statement issued by the Ministry of Forests, the custom statement describing the exported timber, the bill of consignment and letter of credit securing the local bank payment, and loading statement after final clearance by customs. There is a continuous flow of plywood and unprocessed timber to the Sahel countries of Mali and Burkina Faso. Consignments are required to have legal transport documents to cross the border, or alternatively bribes are paid at the border post.

The forest resources were heavily depleted when the Ministry of Forestry opened the market in 1999 to external operators. Political instability and unrest have not favoured legally registered companies and, where there are significant forest resources, have facilitated illegal activity. Power-cuts are frequent and have led to the concentration of log-yards, sawmills and small furniture processors in Conakry.

Joseph Bitter is the only company legally extracting and exporting teak logs in Guinea. Chinese buyers operate informally by sub-contracting locals operating legally with chainsaw permits, or illegally, to harvest timber species such as mahogany and false-teak in the 'Moyenne' and 'Haute Guinée'. Valoris developed an unauthorized road network to log in the Mount Nimba Man and the Biosphere Reserve. This has facilitated penetration of slash-and-burn farmers and degradation of this important chimpanzee habitat.

Forêt Forte is the only timber industry in Guinea Conakry with two sites, one near Conakry, SODEFA, specialized in construction materials and furniture, and the other, the Forêt Forte mill in Nzérékoré, which undertakes timber harvesting and processing to produce veneer, plywood, lumber, flooring and mouldings. Operations are in former logging concessions. Principal species harvested are ako, dabema, framiré, fromager and samba. The company was created in 2002 with new machinery imported from Japan and China. The annual processing capacity of Forest Forte is 46,000 m<sup>3</sup>. Taxes are paid to the local administration

of villages adjacent to the harvest areas and the company is involved in improvement or development of schools, roads, bridges and clinics.

## **Côte d’Ivoire**

The well-maintained road network and the good energy supplies are facilitating log extraction and transportation to local timber processing industries or export products to the maritime ports and frontier crossings. The partition of the country is still physically maintained by the forestry, police, army and customs administrations and there are multiple unnecessary check points every 10 to 20 km on primary and secondary roads. Some organizations were unwilling to be consulted, notably the Directorate of Forest Industries and Production [Direction de la Production et des Industries Forestières (DPIF)] and customs, both institutions deeply implicated in many reported cases of chronic invasive corruption.

Forest permits are allocated to individuals, but not by transparent bidding processes as required under the forest policy and protected forests are sometimes allocated to non-professionals who then sell-on harvesting rights. Criticisms were made by some professionals that bidding processes for permits to log protected forests can lead to the selection of the best offer, which is not necessarily the best choice in terms of forest management and timber utilisation.

## **Nigeria**

The Federal Department of Forestry (FDF) acts as a policy setting and advisory body to the Federal and State Governments. Individual State Governments have authority over forest resource management and utilization in both forest reserves and off-reserve forest, but are expected to comply with national forest policy and legislation. A new policy addressing issues of trade, tariffs and certification was approved in 2006 and legislation is now being updated to reflect the changes. In reality FDF has very limited power and struggles for resources to effectively manage and monitor forest exploitation. With executive power being vested in the states, comprehensive information on the forestry sector is unavailable from FDF. Traditionally, management was done by allocation of concessions granted to timber industries but the concession system began to collapse in the 1980s when local communities were allowed access to the forests and companies lost control. Forestry officials used to conduct monitoring from stump, but then moved monitoring to the forest-gate before abandoning virtually all attempt at control. Now management focuses almost entirely on revenue collection.

Internal control of timber movement is the responsibility of state forest authorities. Official waybills are issued to cover transport of logs or rough-sawn planks harvested in accordance with an official logging permit. However, issue of waybills is apparently without concern for regulations and so there are no effective constraints against movement of any timber,

legally harvested in a community forest, or illegally by chainsaw loggers. Checkpoints manned by forest authorities were reported to be ineffective. In theory a tree should only be felled if a felling permit has been obtained and, when felled, forestry staff should hammer mark stumps and logs, and issue waybills. If this procedure was followed it would constitute a rudimentary procedure for timber tracking. However, forestry officials are rarely, and possibly never, present at the stump, and documents may be issued without adherence to procedures. It is therefore effectively impossible to verify the origin of any timber and therefore to determine legality. There is currently no known intention to introduce timber tracking in Nigeria.

The forestry sector is riddled with weakness. State forestry authorities are focused almost entirely on revenue collection and are undertaking virtually no forest management. Enforcement is almost nonexistent or completely ineffective because of widespread corruption. The depletion of Nigeria's forests, both natural and planted, will undoubtedly mean that pressure increases on nearby countries to supply Nigeria's enormous timber requirements.

## CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR SOCIOECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION IN FORESTRY

### Ghana

Ghana has a good policy and institutional framework under which a wide range of instruments have been set up. A programme to develop certification was set up in the late 1990s and may shortly be restarted, but if Ghana's forests continue to feed domestic and regional markets, and supply the needs of a substantial export industry at current levels, further depletion of the forest resource is inevitable (Blackett and Gardette, 2008; Development Brief, 2008). Some of the challenges facing forestry in Ghana (Development Brief, 2008; Hansen, 2008; Hansen and Treue, 2008; Mayers et al., 2008) include:

- ▶ implementation of policy and the enforcement of regulations in the forest is problematic;
- ▶ the chainsaw ban does not work; rural communities continue to take short-term returns from their assets;
- ▶ use of illegal logs by the industrial sector is not controlled;
- ▶ rates of royalty collection are extremely poor; and
- ▶ there is insufficient capacity to enforce regulations in the face of corruption: forest officers have low salaries and are poorly trained and supported.

## **Liberia**

The FDA is effectively becoming a stakeholder charged with maximizing revenue rather than a facilitator of sustainable forest management. This is perhaps not different from the expectations of governments in other sub-Saharan African countries with timber resources. While concessions have been moribund, chainsaw logging has expanded rapidly. Illegally felled trees are being converted wastefully in-situ to planks, and, in common with much of the rest of the sub-region, the FDA is collecting fees for issue of official waybills and thus giving the business quasi-legal status. There is abundant evidence, in the form of produce being sold at roadside, of widespread charcoal manufacture, which is a further uncontrolled exploitation of forest resources.

## **Sierra Leone**

Illegal logging which escalated since the conflict in 2002 is often managed by Lebanese from Guinea Conakry and Liberia who obtain agreements with Chiefs and employ local people. As it is with the rest of the sub-region, this involves felling and wasteful in-situ processing to produce planks that are manually extracted to roadside for onward transport with quasi-legal status conferred through payment of a fee and issue of official transport documents by the Forestry Division. Despite the ban on logging, which effectively stopped all concession-based operations, chainsaw logging continues seemingly unabated due to increasing tendency for corrupt practices among forestry officials.

Before the ban, community management of off-reserve forest areas was reported to be fraught with problems, including lack of any control and the sole beneficiaries being the powerful individuals within the community and not the community at large. The lack of control and possible competition within communities for a share of the resource is undoubtedly a stimulus for the proliferation of chainsaw logging and a great deal of effort will be required if post-ban logging is to be improved.

## **Benin**

In recent years the demand for teak and false-teak driven by Indian and Chinese importers, has strongly affected harvest rates and trade of these species. Timber shortages are limiting local processing and industries now survive by using wood often of unknown origin. There is no coordination between forestry, customs and port authorities for collection of timber statistics and there are no records of informal trade.

Despite punitive operations to confiscate illegal timber, lorries and containers, there is no effective control of illegal logging operations carried out at night in the large protected forests. The porosity of the border and the good road network facilitate timber movement within Benin and to neighbouring countries. There is inadequate staff capacity in Cotonou Port which cannot easily check all the exported wood. Only about 3,000 m<sup>3</sup> per year, which

is a very small proportion of the reported export volume, is checked. The level of effective enforcement is variable. The customs procedures require two key documents, the Conformity Certificate and the Export Statement.

There is an urgent need for privatization of the state-owned teak processing industry and plantations which were originally developed with GTZ support to ONAB. The Saclo mill is dying and the formerly well-managed teak plantations are being heavily degraded. Investment is essential to restore the potential of the teak plantations. Reforestation inside protected forests should be carried out in core areas with indigenous species and with commercial species on the periphery.

## Togo

Forest reserves and protected areas are not effectively protected or managed and many are heavily degraded and subject to uncontrolled encroachment, the illegal gathering of non-wood forest products (NWFPs), poaching and timber theft. The main difficulty in protecting and managing forests in Togo is the heavy pressure on them from an impoverished rural population. Indeed, pressure on the existing forest reserves is already high and the Ministry for Environment and Natural Resources, which is in charge of forests, is unable to secure their integrity. There is still some timber potential in the 'plateaux' region and in conservation areas, which are often occupied by illegal settlements. Forestry training capacity is very limited and fewer than ten personnel in the forestry administration have higher education in forestry or environmental management. There is a lack of a national sustainable forest management (SFM) framework and of forest management standards for natural forests. Privately owned, planted forests are now being developed and will complement the teak and other plantations.

## Guinea

Timber statistics are inadequate due to the limited capacity of the forest administration and the absence of coordination and interest between forestry, customs and port administrations. There are no computerized records, timber database or records of informal trade.

The naïve approach of the forest administration to open-up forest resources to potential industries without appropriate forest legislation and the lack of control and enforcement at local level, led to the ban of most of the allocated forest permits in 2002. The timber resources of the 'Guinée Forestière' were looted in the four years from 1999 to 2002. Of the two remaining legal operators, Forêt Forte, now has limited resources available for its mill. The increasing number of wood buyers exporting containers of logs, either teak or other species, led to a ban of all timber exports in early 2008 and the confiscation of 2,000 containers. Forêt Forte pays a number of taxes for harvesting. An area charge of 8,000 Guinean Francs per ha is applicable over 167,000 ha and in addition it pays stumpage fees,

reforestation fees and export taxes. Villages and prefectures receive 45% of the taxes and 55% goes to national forest funds.

## Côte d'Ivoire

Protected forests have been heavily depleted by conversion to coffee and cacao plantations by illegal settlers from Burkina Faso and other neighbouring countries. Also affected were 2 million ha of conservation areas, national park and nature reserves. The Forestry Development Society [Société de Développement des Forêts (SODEFOR)] has been responsible since 1992 for the management of the 220 protected forests covering over four million ha. The Ministry of Environment, Water Affairs and Forestry [Ministère de l'Environnement, des Eaux et Forêts (MINEEF)] and the DPIF are responsible for 380 PFE, which are reserves, of at least 25,000 ha, covering 14 million ha.

There is no effective coordination of statistics between different administrations (DISA, DPIF, SODEFOR, customs and port authorities), and informal trade is not recorded. From 2004 to 2006, the number of timber species utilised was 21 for redwoods with a production volume of 500,000 m<sup>3</sup>, 17 for whitewoods (850,000 m<sup>3</sup>) and 55 of various other species (71,000 m<sup>3</sup>). The volume of redwoods extracted is decreasing. Production of the seven main timber species (acajou, fraké, framiré, fromager, iroko, samba and teak) represented more than 70% of the total volume from 2004 to 2006 with an average of about 1.08 million m<sup>3</sup>. An additional 13 species (ako, anegre, azobe, badi, bahia, dabema, ilomba, kapokier, koto, lingue, niangon, sipo and tiama) account for 24% of the mean annual volume with the remaining 60 species harvested accounting for only 2%.

Most companies in Côte d'Ivoire are being consolidated into bigger industrial groups (e.g. SIFCI-CIB). Lebanese are now predominant in management of the industry, followed by French, Italian and Spanish. Indian and Chinese nationals who are increasingly active in the raw material trade, especially of teak to India and false teak to China. This represents potential source of rapid forest degradation. There is therefore, the need to regulate involvement in the timber business to control the activities of those who are interested in quick financial returns rather than developing timber processing industries and the national economy. Obstacles to FLEGT implementation are the large turnover of administrative staff and administrative conflicts. There is a need to reinforce the administrative capacity.

## Nigeria

Concession management is no longer operational and much of the logging is undertaken by uncontrolled chainsaw gangs, with felled trees wastefully processed in-situ to produce rough-sawn planks for manual extraction to road-side, or rafted as logs to point of sale. This trade is illegal or is given quasi-legal status through issue of waybills by forestry officials. Some revenue is collected by this means but much is lost through corruption that is reported to be rampant. Charcoal production is apparently widespread. This is a further

activity being undertaken by rural dwellers. Produce is transported to urban centres for local sale or export. There is no control and production utilizes all wood in the vicinity so completely destroying surrounding forest. The extent and volume of this business is unknown but thought to be substantial.

Community forest management was attempted in the 1990s in Cross River State with support from the United Kingdom Department for International Development (DFID), and continues to be supported by NGOs, such as Concern Universal. The approach has government recognition and the intended procedure is that the state, subject to the consent of a landowner or community, controls harvesting by issue of logging permits. Control is weak and even if regulations are complied with, it is thought that up to 60% of community logging is illegal and that there is no way of verifying that the other 40% is legal.

There are several obstacles to SFM in Nigeria. These include:

- ▶ the discretionary power of government to de-reserve or harvest the forests,
- ▶ the lack of a coherent forest policy,
- ▶ the prevalence of illegal logging and harvesting of NWFPs in most of the high-forest states,
- ▶ chronic under-resourcing of forestry programs and forest management,
- ▶ overlapping responsibilities among federal, state and local governments and excessive bureaucracy; the lack of inter-sectorial coordination, and
- ▶ the overall absence of reliable data on which to base forestry planning and development.

Nigeria has a long history of forest management and the formal goal is to achieve self-sufficiency in all aspects of forest production; however, the country, once a significant exporter, is now a net importer of primary forest products and considerable work must be done to achieve this goal.

The growing magnitude of this trade conflicts directly with the objectives of the FLEGT initiative in the sub-region and the dramatic recent increase in exports, if continued, will have a devastating and accelerating impact on remaining local resources which will eventually spread to regional resources. Any aspirations for sustainable forest management need to consider the issue of charcoal production and more information on the nature of the business and the trade is essential to determine actions that might be required. Unknown quantities of teak are shipped to India, although if customs data was accessible official trade volumes should be quantifiable.

## SUMMARY AT THE SUB-HUMID WEST AFRICA LEVEL

Appendix 1 presents a summary of key issues in forest management in West Africa. Forest resources are increasingly declining while the scope of utilization seems to be expanding, though forest industries are still relatively rudimentary. Though timber trade and flow remain an important component of the economies of many West African States, illegal harvesting appears to be on the increase and tend to hamper the realization of full economic potential of the sector. Export procedures in many of the countries are fraught with corruption while certification is yet to be seen as being of great relevance in sustainable management of forests. Effective forest governance structures should be instituted, encouraged to flourish and properly entrenched if the remnants of forests in the sub-region are to be sustainably managed.

# **CHAPTER 4: FLEGT in sub-Humid West Africa: Causes of Illegal Forestry Related Activities**

Sustainable Forest Management does not appear to be attractive in many parts of sub-Saharan Africa. Over the years illegal activities have gained ground in the forestry sector through the activities of virtually all stakeholders. There have been cases of collusion between forestry officials and timber takers, just as many governments have placed greater emphasis on forest revenue generation than forest regeneration and management. A combination of these factors has increasingly made certification unattractive in sub-Saharan Africa. In an ideal world, all producers would be voluntarily certified in a rigorous sustainable forest management certification scheme, thereby proving that their forests are being sustainably managed; buyers and consumers could then decide only to buy certified timber from sustainable supplies. However, in the tropics, the difficulties, including costs and skills required to attain this goal, are often great. The fact is, although things may now be changing, there has been much resistance in the past from both governments and producers. Some of the common causes for illegal forestry related activities in West Africa are described below.

## **INADEQUACY OF FOREST MANAGEMENT DATA**

Sustainable Forest Management thrives where adequate inventory data are available for the development and periodic review of forest management and working plans. For many countries in sub-Saharan Africa, these are now rare occurrences. Concessions are now based on arbitrariness and political will and caprices.

## **POOR MARKETING AND PRICING POLICIES**

A large number of timbers in sub-Saharan Africa are obtained from natural sources, with little or no information on age, yield and quality. This makes price determination an arduous task. Most times prices are fixed arbitrarily without financial and cost considerations. In the final analysis it is the rent-seeking loggers that gain to the detriment of society.

## INSUFFICIENT NATIONAL CAPACITY TO CONTROL ILLEGAL LOGGING

Logging precludes certification, such that even legitimate concessionaires (who do not have the authority to stop illegal logging) will be prevented from achieving certification if there is illegal logging inside their concession areas.

## LACK OF POLITICAL WILL

Many governments tend to compromise national interest for political gains in the fight against illegal activities in forestry. Without national level support from government and all key stakeholder groups it is unlikely that illegal activities will abate. Given the importance of state-owned forests in most sub-Saharan Africa countries, the State should have an even greater sense of responsibility than in other regions for the sound management of its national forest resource, even where this responsibility is passed on to concessionaires.

## CAPACITY AND LOGISTIC CHALLENGES

Many governments in sub-Saharan Africa lack national capacity to control illegal logging. In many instances patrol vehicles, defence and communication equipment are lacking. This often exposes the poorly trained and equipped forestry staff to danger against the often more sophisticated illegal loggers.

## WEAK LEGISLATION AND POOR ENFORCEMENT

The existing laws in many sub-Saharan Africa countries are so weak too enforce deterrence. In many cases the laws cannot even be enforced due to poor institutional arrangements. Currently non-compliance with national legislation and regulations is frequently either not detected, or, if detected, the necessary corrective actions and penalties are often not enforced or avoided through corruption.

# **CHAPITRE 5 Way Forward with FLEGT in sub-Humid West Africa**

The problems facing countries and producers vary with each situation but there are constraints common to many and some of them are felt particularly strongly in the context of West African sub-humid tropical forests and countries. Major common constraints are presented below.

## **MAJOR CONSTRAINTS COMMON TO WEST AFRICAN COUNTRIES**

### **Lack of political will**

Without national level support from governments and all key stakeholder groups, it is unlikely that certification will progress in anything other than a piecemeal fashion, with concessionaires and producers proceeding individually and in small numbers. Given the importance of state-owned forests in most African countries the State should have an even greater sense of responsibility than in other regions for the sound management of its national forest resource, even where this responsibility is passed on to concessionaires. In most cases, if companies were compliant with national regulations, the steps required to achieve certified status would be minimal.

### **Lack of national standards**

There is need for national standards which can greatly increase stakeholder ownership and make certification more relevant to the country and easier to implement.

### **Lack of a national dialogue**

Effective policy dialogues among government, producers, buyers and local communities will ensure that responsibilities are understood and accepted and that there are fair benefit sharing mechanisms in place.

### **Lack or cost of acquisition of the necessary skills**

Necessary skills are required to introduce improved forest management planning and implementation from the forest to the market.

## **Difficulties and costs in a competitive environment**

Many individual producers will find SFM certification technically too difficult and costly, in terms of implementing improved management systems and covering inspection costs, in the current conditions of price-driven competition. This issue is magnified by the fact that the costs of implementing SFM and undertaking certification usually apply to entire forest management units, whereas improved market access benefits only a fraction of the products (i.e. specific combinations of species, product, grade, and client). If, in addition, the total output is reduced, costs per m<sup>3</sup> are bound to increase.

## **Lack of clear incentives**

In terms of price and market share for certified timber products, there is insufficient trade in certified products to deter illegal or unsustainable trade in tropical timber. Price advantages are also a fragile argument: the tropical timber industry is linked to the world's economy and a downturn in the world timber demand, and hence price, especially from high value markets, will undoubtedly reduce the incentive for companies to embrace new non-mandatory schemes.

## **Lack of a level playing field**

Owing to the inherent voluntary nature of certification, there is a lack of a level playing field. Even compliant producers may fear to be put at a competitive disadvantage if they pursue certification in isolation because of the likely cost implications of raising management standards and achieving certification while producers solely interested in quick profits will not be included.

## **Lack of goodwill**

Some operators may resist or circumvent any moves to regulate forest harvesting because they obtain a significant proportion of their timber supplies through illegal harvesting.

## **INSTITUTIONS, NETWORKS AND KEY INDIVIDUALS WORKING WITH ISSUES OF FLEGT**

There are a number of existing academic and research institutions in West Africa with interest in forestry matters. These institutions can form the fulcrum for networking on issues related to FLEGT. Their activities will include locating, collecting, synthesizing and sharing information through such avenues as workshops, symposia, seminars and periodic conferences. Other social networks on the internet such as facebook and blog can be optimally explored and exploited to locate individuals and to share information. At the

moment, a cost-effective approach will be to adopt the existing structures of such organizations as the African Network for Agroforestry Education (ANAFE) and the African Forest Research Network (AFORNET). Both organizations have operational nodes in West Africa. For example, ANAFE operates in West Africa within an agro-ecological structure called the Humid Lowlands of West Africa (HULWA) while AFORNET operates within a structure called West and Central African node. Within these structures are focal and member institutions. A list of individuals and their institutional affiliations is contained in Annex 2.

## Conclusion

For now, FLEGT may not be adjudged to be effective in the sub-humid West African sub-region. There are however some promising scenarios, granted the cooperation of all stakeholders. With the emerging level of awareness among stakeholders of the role of certification and the role of market forces, in the right circumstances, forest management may be positively influenced. In only a few years we may reach a point where the majority of the timber trade is certified. The emergence of new non-Forest Stewardship Council (FSC) certification schemes in Europe and Africa may also be good news for forests, provided that these address the current lack of recognition of certified products in the market place and gain support from environmental groups, without causing confusion for buyers and customers or diluting the standards involved. As have been observed in several reports, voluntary certification has much to contribute; however, there are a number of obstacles in its way before it can deliver SFM on a large scale. It is therefore a matter of concern that, until recently, international forest policy debates did not appear to contemplate any serious alternative to certification - except for more institutional capacity building as part of a traditional government 'command and control' approach, which has had little impact so far on the level of illegal logging. Certification has had obvious limitations to date in natural tropical forests. The area certified is still small in regional or global terms, although it is on the increase. As of March 2003 the total area of certified forest globally was 139.2 million ha. The vast majority of this area is in North America and Europe. The rest of the world only contributes 5% to the total area certified. The predominance of industrial forests also indicates that certification has failed to have the desired impact in natural forests. The question therefore that needs to be asked is why has the progress of certification been so slow in developing countries? The answer may be found in the limited support from consumers, industry and some governments for the current certification process because of what many of them consider as limited incentive to pay a higher price for certified timber if they are given the choice. These issues need to be properly addressed for FLEGT to be effective in the West African sub-region.

# References

- Amanor, K.S. 2003. Natural and Cultural Assets and Participatory Forest Management in West Africa. International Conference on Natural Assets held at Political Economic Research Institute and Centre for Science and Environment, Tagaytay city, The Philippines, 8-11 January, 2003.
- Blackett, H. and Gardette, E., 2008. Cross-border flows of timber and wood products in West Africa. European Commission. Final Report, HTSPE Ltd.
- Blundell, A.G. 2008. On the benefits of incorporating forestry into The extractive industries transparency initiative, With specific reference to Liberia. Scoping Study.
- Brack, D. 2009. Combating Illegal Logging. Interaction with WTO Rules. Energy, Environment and Resource Governance (June 2009) EERG IL BP 2009/01. The Royal Institute of International Affairs.
- Contreras-Hermosilla, A. 2002. Law Compliance in the Forestry Sector. An Overview. The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/The World Bank 1818 H Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20433, U.S.A. 47 pages. Stock No. 37205.
- Development Brief. 2008. Illegal logging in Ghana. Forest and Landscape. Development Brief. Policy, No. 5, December 2005.
- Eben, M.A. 2003. Forest Management Considering Poverty Alleviation in West Africa, Particularly Liberia. Paper submitted to the XII World Forestry Congress, Quebec City, Canada.
- Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO). 2001. Situation des forêts du Monde. FAO. Rome.
- Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO). 2003. Forestry Outlook Study for Africa. FAO, Rome.
- Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO). 2004. The Forest Revenue System and Government Expenditure on Forestry in Liberia. FAO, Rome.
- Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO). 2006. Global Forest Resource Assessment 2005. FAO, Rome.
- Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO). 2009. State of the world Forest. FAO, Rome.
- Forestry Development Authority, Liberia (FDA). 2002. Forestry and Wildlife report for Liberia for the period 1998-2000. Doe J.W. FDA, Monrovia, Liberia. May, 2002.

- Greenpeace. 2002. Forest crime file: country profile - Liberian timber trade fuels regional in security.
- Hansen, C. P. 2008. Illegal Logging in Ghana. Development Policy Briefs No. 5.
- Hansen, C. P. Treue, T. 2008. Assessing illegal logging in Ghana. *International Forestry Review* 10: 573-590.
- ITTO. 2006. Status of tropical forest management 2005. Summary Report. A special edition of the Tropical Forest Update 2006/1. International Tropical Timber Organization.
- MacKinnon, J. and MacKinnon, K. 1986. Review of the Protected Areas System in the Afrotropical Realm. IUCN/UNEP, Gland, Switzerland.
- Mayers, J., Birikorang, G., Danso, E., Nketiah, K. S., Richards, M. 2008. Assessment of Potential Impacts in Ghana of a Voluntary Partnership Agreement with the EC on Forest Governance. IIED, London.
- Owino, F. and Ndinga, A. 2004. Study on forest administration and related institutional arrangements. A report prepared for the project Lessons Learnt on Sustainable Forest Management in Africa.
- Parren, M. and de Graaf, N.R. 1995. The quest for natural forest management in Ghana, Cote d'Ivoire and Liberia. The Tropenbos Foundation, Wageningen, The Netherlands.
- PEP. 1997. Profil Environnemental Pays du Bénin, Côte d'Ivoire et Togo.
- Portugal-Perez, A. and Wilson, J.S. 2008. Trade Costs in Africa: Barriers and Opportunities for Reform. The World Bank Development Research Group Trade Team. Policy Research Working Paper 4619. [http://econ.worldbank.org/projects/trade\\_costs](http://econ.worldbank.org/projects/trade_costs).
- Rochow, K.W.J., Simpson R., Brownell, A. and Pierson, O. 2007. The Liberia Forest Concession Review: Lessons for resource management and restoration of the rule of law. *Journal of Peacekeeping & Development* 3:89-93.
- Statistiques DISA. (undated). SPIB, port de San Pedro. Côte d'Ivoire.
- United Nations Security Council. 2003. Report of the Secretary-General in pursuance of paragraph 19 of resolution 1478 (2003) concerning Liberia.
- US Department of State. 2008. Background Note: Sierra Leone.
- USITC. 2007. Sub-Saharan Africa: Factors Affecting Trade Patterns of Selected Industries. First Annual Report. Publication 3914. Investigation No. 332—477. U.S. International Trade Commission Washington, DC 20436. [www.usitc.gov](http://www.usitc.gov).

VPA. 2005. The True Cost of Legal Timber. Ministry of Lands, Forestry & Mines – Ghana. VPA discussion paper 1, December, 2005.

Woods, J., Blundell, A.J., and Simpson, R. 2008. Investment in the liberian forest sector. A roadmap to legal forest operations in Liberia. UK Foreign & Commonwealth Office – Beijing, China.

World Bank. 2006. Strengthening Forest Law Enforcement and Governance: Addressing a Systemic Constraint to Sustainable Development. The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / THE WORLD BANK 1818 H Street, NW Washington, DC 20433 USA. Report No. 36638-GLB.

World Bank / WWF Alliance. 2002. Forest Law Assessment In Selected African Countries. Final Draft. SGS Global Trade Solutions (GTS). Natural Resource Monitoring Services (NRMS) Sustainable Forestry Programme, Geneva, Switzerland.

World Bank / WWF Alliance. 2003. Establishing the Foundation for Sustainable Forest Management in Africa Legal Origin of Timber as a Step Towards Sustainable Forest Management. Final Draft. SGS Global Trade Solutions (GTS). Natural Resource Monitoring Services (NRMS) Sustainable Forestry Programme, Geneva, Switzerland.

WWF. 2008. Illegal wood for the European market An analysis of the EU import and export of illegal wood and related products. WWF-Germany. [www.forestconsulting.de](http://www.forestconsulting.de).

Zakharenka, A. 2006. Sustainable Forest Management in Liberia: How to integrate conservation approaches into forest management? What does it mean for the country? How will it affect regional and global biodiversity? Virginia Tech, College of Natural Resources, National Capital Region. Conservation Ecology, NR 5724 Midterm paper.

# ANNEX 1:

## Country-Based Summary of Issues in Sub-Humid West Africa (Figures are For 2007 unless otherwise stated)

Country	Benin	Ghana	Guinea Conakry	Ivory Coast	Liberia	Nigeria	Sierra Leone	Togo
<b>Forest Resources</b>	2.3 million ha (forest & savannah) 351,000ha of protected forests 14,000 ha of teak plantations managed by ONAB	5.5 million ha (forest & savannah) 1.2 million ha of forest reserve and additional forest in off-reserve areas	6.7 million ha (forest & savannah) 312,000ha in Guinée forestière zone including 260,000ha of protected forests Some timber potential in moyenne and haute Guinée zones Unknown areas of scattered teak plantations	10.4 million ha (forest & savannah) 4 million ha of concessions (PEF) 4 million ha protected & managed by SODEFOR 168,000ha of plantations, mainly teak	3.4 million ha (forest & savannah) 2.4 million ha of dense forest 1 million ha open dense forest	11.1 million ha (forest & savannah) 2 million ha of forest reserve in high forest zone 975,000ha of forest reserve estimated to be productive 2.3 million ha in off-reserve forests estimated to be partially productive	2.8 million ha (forest & savannah) 400,000ha of forest reserves & protected forests 635,000ha of closed high forest 260,000ha of secondary forest	500,000ha (forest & savannah) 27,000ha of teak & eucalyptus plantations under state & private ownership 400,000ha in Plateaux Region converted to agriculture since 1999 & remain degraded
<b>Utilisation</b>	46,000 m <sup>3</sup> (official harvest) 44,000m <sup>3</sup> (unofficial harvest)	2 million m <sup>3</sup> AAC 935,000m <sup>3</sup> officially harvested (2005) 2.3 million m <sup>3</sup> estimated unofficial harvest (2005) by formal industries & chainsaw loggers	46,000 m <sup>3</sup> officially harvested by Forest Forte Unknown volumes of teak harvested by Joseph Bitter	1.4 million m <sup>3</sup> official production from forest reserves & 120,000 m <sup>3</sup> from protected forests 100,000 m <sup>3</sup> from teak plantations ~1.5 million m <sup>3</sup> illegal harvesting	Formerly only illegal production of unknown volume, but now official logging under TSCs & FMCs Sustainable harvest thought to be 800,000 m <sup>3</sup>	Minimal legal production supplying exporting industries Unknown levels of illegal production supplying domestic & export markets	Logging ban recently lifted & unknown volumes being harvested illegally by chainsaw loggers	34,000 m <sup>3</sup> harvested from protected forest 1 million tones consumed as fuelwood
<b>Illegal Harvesting</b>	Limited industries are facing raw material shortages because of high level of teak exported to India 1 state-owned (Saclo), a few	7 million m <sup>3</sup> processing capacity concentrated in 10 leading companies located mainly in Kumasi & Takoradi	Recently developed industry with only two companies legally exporting & high incidence of illegal activity Official	Large industry processing 2.4 million m <sup>3</sup> sourced officially from forest areas, protected forests & illegally	No major industries in operation	Industry in decline due to shortage of timber supply. Mostly concentrated in Edo State & permitted to export semi-	Rudimentary industries mainly producing rough sawn lumber	Industries mostly inactive due to timber supply shortages as a result of high level of exports from state-owned

Country	Benin	Ghana	Guinea Conakry	Ivory Coast	Liberia	Nigeria	Sierra Leone	Togo
	small companies & many log-yards	Large informal sector sourcing from illegal chainsaw gangs	processing capacity less than 50,000 m <sup>3</sup>			finished & finished products		teak plantations to China & India
<b>Timber Trade</b>	3,000t (sawnwood & mouldings) to EU ~48,000 m <sup>3</sup> to China & India (largely illegal teak & falseteak) Logs & lumber (unknown volumes) to Togo & Sahel	407,000 m <sup>3</sup> official maritime exports including 127,000 m <sup>3</sup> of teak 122,000 m <sup>3</sup> official regional exports ~300,000 m <sup>3</sup> unofficial regional exports ~300,000 m <sup>3</sup> official & unofficial domestic sales 290,000 m <sup>3</sup> recorded imports of wood products (2005) ~200,000 m <sup>3</sup> unrecorded imports of teak	8,740t officially exported to EU, mainly lumber ~60,000t (2,500 containers) exported illegally Unknown volumes exported overland	350,000 m <sup>3</sup> officially exported to EU & 170,000 m <sup>3</sup> to other destinations (processed products) 245,000 m <sup>3</sup> officially exported to China & India (logs, lumber & poles) ~200,000 m <sup>3</sup> of teak logs illegally exported to Ghana ~100,000 m <sup>3</sup> officially exported within the region & unknown volumes of unofficial exports Alleged illegal supply from Ghana, Liberia & Guinea Conakry	~626,000 m <sup>3</sup> of exports (2000) with those to EU exceeding 200,000t (2001 & 2002) prior to UN ban on exports Minimal exports to EU recorded in 2004 & 2007 Evidence/allegations of illegal exports of lumber by sea & overland to Ivory Coast, Guinea Conakry & Elsewhere	Minimal export trade in wood products (11,000t to EU), but 85,000t of charcoal exported to EU 74,000 m <sup>3</sup> of plywood imported from Ghana & increasing Small but unknown volumes of logs lumber & poles exported regionally Unknown volumes of teak & gmelina logs exported to China & India 10 million m <sup>3</sup> of logs & lumber estimated to be supplied to local markets Alleged imports from Cameroon	Minimal known exports (1,158t exported to the EU) Unknown volumes of illegal exports overland to Guinea Conakry & Liberia & by sea to China	9,700t recorded as exported (2005) with 1,172t to EU Unknown volumes of teak exported to India 96,000 m <sup>3</sup> of falseteak unofficially exported to China 90,000 m <sup>3</sup> imported from neighbouring countries
<b>Certification</b>	No activity	Samaratex, Ghana Primewood, JohnBitar & Co., Logs & Lumber & Scanstyle Mim are members of GFTN & aiming for FSC Certification of areas totaling	Forêt Forte in compliance with 80% of FSC criteria at recent audit	Inprobois is aiming to become FSC certified SODEFOR, funded by OAB has developed principles & criteria for sustainable forest	No activity	No activity	No activity	No activity

Country	Benin	Ghana	Guinea Conakry	Ivory Coast	Liberia	Nigeria	Sierra Leone	Togo
		330,000ha FSC Regional Office is in Ghana		management				
<b>Control of Timber Movement</b>	Controls are largely ineffective & unable to prevent illegal logging done at night in protected forests	The Forestry Commission's FSD is meant to check official harvesting at stump, but apparently not often done Timber in transit is inspected at TIDD checkpoints, but corruption is reported & controls are easily circumvented Controls do not hinder movement of illegal timber harvested by chainsaw gangs	Chainsaw permits are issued, but no control is exercised over harvesting by villagers Timber exports were banned in early 2008	Many checkpoints are operated by customs, forest officials, police and army, but provide almost no control Bribes paid at checkpoints allow routine movement of timber without inspection	No control has been exercised over harvesting & timber movement is made quasi-legal by payment of fees for issue of an official waybill Now SGS are contracted to establish chain of custody (COC) procedures & manage movement & export of timber, but will only cover official logging under TSCs & FMCs	Control is the responsibility of state forest authorities, but control of harvesting is no longer exercised Official waybills are issued to allow transport of timber, whether legal or illegal & there is no effective control	MAFFS's Forestry Division issues licences for transport of timber & operates checkpoints, but even during the logging ban there was no control of timber movement & bribes are routinely paid Cooperation between forest authority, police & customs is poor	The Ministry of Forestry issues transport documents for timber, but provides no effective control that would detect or prevent illegal timber operations
<b>Timber Tracking</b>	No effective procedures in operation	Paper based system in operation to track official production from concessions In theory there is inspection at stump & then transport documents are issued, which identify source licence area	No effective procedures in operation except in Forêt Forte areas where COC is implemented as part of the effort to achieve certification	Test being implemented of timber tracking system by SGS with companies such as Inprobois & NSA	Electronic timber tracking now being implemented by SGS (see above)	No effective procedures in operation	No effective procedures in operation	No effective procedures in operation
<b>Export Procedures</b>	Exporter requires Conformity Certificate and Export statement issued by the Ministry of Forests after inspection of	Export Permits are issued by the Forestry Commission's TIDD after checking exporter status, contracts, mill	Exporter requires Conformity Certificate & an Export Certificate issued by the Ministry of	A Specific Statement describing the consignment & a Certificate of Origin are issued by DG MINEEF A	The exporter must have an Export Licence for each consignment, which is issued by SGS after confirmation that products have valid COC to confirm origin Customs will issue a	FDI issue letters supporting export after checking various requirements including	MAFFS issue Export Permits on payment of appropriate fees Export consignments are meant to be inspected	The exporter must provide a Conformity Certificate with details of species, origin & product for checking by

Country	Benin	Ghana	Guinea Conakry	Ivory Coast	Liberia	Nigeria	Sierra Leone	Togo
	<p>timber A loading Statement is prepared by Customs after satisfactory check of Conformity Certificate, Bill of Consignment &amp; Letter of Credit. Cargo is then released for export</p> <p>A computerized system (SYGUCE) is being introduced</p>	<p>input/output records &amp; financial documentation</p> <p>Customs jointly inspect export consignments with TIDD &amp; containers are then sealed</p> <p>Exporter prepares a Customs Export Declaration &amp; after inspection of all associated documentation, consignment is released for export</p>	<p>Forests after inspection of timber A</p> <p>Customs Statement is prepared by Customs after satisfactory check of documentation &amp; cargo is then released for export</p> <p>A computerized system (SYDONIA) is being introduced</p>	<p>Customs Statement is completed by the exporter &amp; after inspection by Customs a Loading Statement is issued</p> <p>The commercial bill is made with VAT, later reimbursed to the exporter</p>	<p>release document subject to the consignment having a valid Export License and satisfactory preshipment inspection</p> <p>Inspection was formerly contracted to Bivac, but SGS has now taken over this role</p>	<p>confirmation of source &amp; legality, although there is no practical way in which this can be achieved &amp; FDF do no physical checking</p> <p>The Ministry of Finance issues Export Permits on receipt of FDF support letter</p> <p>The Exporter submits an application to customs with relevant documents including a Clean Certificate of Inspection provided by Cobalt Inspection Services.</p> <p>Inspection may be done jointly with customs &amp; forestry officials before the container is sealed &amp; customs issue a Cargo Release Order</p>	<p>by forestry &amp; customs officials before container sealing, but customs claim that this rarely happens due to poor collaboration &amp; containers may be sealed by shipping agents</p> <p>After inspection of documents customs will authorize release for export to port authorities &amp; the container will be inspected by scanning before final release.</p>	<p>forestry officials</p> <p>An Exportation Statement is issued by the Ministry of Forests after checking terms of business &amp; payment</p> <p>After final inspection by customs a Loading Statement is issued &amp; containers can be loaded &amp; sealed for export</p>
<b>Trends</b>	<p>Timber shortages are limiting local processing</p> <p>Growing demand from India for teak &amp; Chinese</p>	<p>Exports to Europe declining</p> <p>Shortage of timber has resulted in factory closures</p>	<p>Increasing illegal exports to China of false-teak &amp; other species</p>	<p>Many factory consolidations &amp; increasing development of secondary processing</p>	<p>Issue of TSCs &amp; FMCs will allow legal export, but industry not well developed &amp; likely to be mainly logs at present</p> <p>Local demand</p>	<p>Nigeria is now a net importer of timber, including plywood from Ghana</p>	<p>Very limited exporting industries &amp; supply is mainly for local market</p> <p>Illegal</p>	<p>Industries face chronic shortages of wood</p> <p>Togo is a net importer of timber,</p>

Country	Benin	Ghana	Guinea Conakry	Ivory Coast	Liberia	Nigeria	Sierra Leone	Togo
	for false teak	& consolidation, with sources abroad attracting increasing interest The regional market, particularly Nigeria, is growing in importance & the Sahel remains an important market, largely for illegal timber		Europe exports are declining, but increasing exports to other African nations & China & India	is likely to continue to be met from uncontrolled chainsaw logging	Local demand for lumber is still met largely from uncontrolled harvesting of local sources, but can be expected to shift increasingly to other producing nations in the region	exports to China have been increasing & this trend is likely to continue without improved enforcement	mainly plywood & lumber from Ghana supplied both legally & illegally Logs are illegally sourced from protected forests in Benin

## ANNEX 2:

### Institutions, networks and key individuals working on issues of Forest Law Enforcement, Governance in Sub-Humid West Africa.

FLEGT Contacts		
<b>Benin</b>		
Abdu, Idrissou	CPAC ONG	Directeur
Adanmado, Franck	ASSOPILO ONG	Directeur
Adjadjihoue E, Luc	Afrique espoir ONG	Directeur
Adjomantin, Vincent	Chef Brigade douane Igolo vers frontière Nigéria	
Adjounihin, Athanase	Chef Scierie ONAB (Bohicon)	
Adounvodehotin, Ulrich	Ministère du plan	Assistant technique
Agbangla, Gaétan	Ancien Directeur Technique Projet PAMF :	Conseiller Technique du Ministre en Charge des Forêts
Akani, Idrissou	Chef d'Unité gestion des Forêts ONAB (Bohicon)	
Akossou, O. Raphaël	Directeur Technique de l'ONAB (Bohicon)	
Akouehou, Gaston	Directeur du Projet Bois de Feu Phase II	
Akouta, Bertin	ANUB	Directeur
Alaho, Anzise	ANUB	
Amegankpoe, Claudia	ECO ECOLO ONG	Directrice
Araye, Cécile		
Ategui, Vincent	AERAMR ONG	Directeur
Ayadji et Fils	SOCAAF SARL* (Bohicon)	
Ayikpa, Josué	Rame	Formateur
Azogan, Celestin	PPD ONG	Directeur
Chabi M., Blanche	ANUB	
Cyriaque, Atti-Mama	Directeur général adjoint du port autonome de Cotonou	
Dako, Marthe Epse Djossou	ANUB	
Dan, Félicité Mme	Port autonome Receveur de la Douane	
Deguenon, Raoul	FNAFV Fédération nationale des artisans de branche fibres végétales	Président
Demide, Albertine	ANUB	
Djossou L., Benjamin	Opérateur économique	
Fafolahan, Honorine	ANUB	
Gbegotossa, Paul	MJCD	Directeur
Guenier, Joëlle	Délégation de la Commission Européenne Bénin	Chargée programmes social et bonne gouvernance
Houaye, Kouassi Pierre	ONAB (Office National du Bois)	Directeur Général
Meenik, Hans	SNV ONG	Directeur
Mekoun, Raphaël	ANUB	
Nsia, Séverin	Ministère du plan Expert local	
Oude, Pascal	Ministère des Forêts et des Ressources Naturelles	Directeur Général

Sagbo, James	Douanes	Directeur general
Sodegla, Cocou, Honoré	CRAPE ONG	Directeur
Sossou, Justin	Global developpement ONG	Directeur
Soude Zinsou, Jacques	CIPCRE ONG	Directeur
Tabe, Lafia Paul	Receveur de la Douane à la Frontière TOGO (ILLACONDJI)	Receveur
Tchogou, Benoît	Chef de la Brigade forestière du Port	Chef de la Brigade forestière
Tchombou Yamgue, Augustin	Africa Teak	Directeur
Tokpanou, Nikita	Flambeau du Progrès ONG	Directeur
Zotto A., Solange	APASIC ONG	
<b>Ghana</b>		
Abdullah, Mohamed	John Bitar Ltd. Production	Manager
Adeleke, Adewale	IUCN FLEGT	Project Facilitator
Agyeman, Fredua	Ministry of Lands Forestry & Mines	Technical Director
Asamoah-Twum, Kwaku	Customs, Excise & Preventative Service	Chief Collector
Attah, Alhassan	Forestry Commission, TIDD	Executive Director
Baffoe, Abraham	WWF GFTN	
Birikorang, Gene	Hamilton Resources & Consulting	Chief Consultant
Borker Bjerre, Niklas	EC Delegation Ghana	Programme Officer
Coleman, Henry	Forestry Commission, TIDD	Contract & Permit Manager
Helou, Rodrigue	EI Ghana Primewood Products	Assistant general Manager
Katakou, Albert	Care International	Project Manager
Manilio	Machinedwood	General Manager
Naezer, Dick	EC Delegation Ghana	First Counsellor
Nketiah, Sam Tropenbos	International Ghana Programme	Team Leader
Opoku, Kyeretwie	Civic Response	
Schneeman, Jochem	ICCO	Programme Officer
<b>Guinea Conakry</b>		
Barry, M.	Ministère Commerce Extérieur	Directeur adjoint
Bazzo, Didier	Office guinéen national des mangroves	Directeur
Bensemou, M	NGO droits civiques	Directeur
Camara, M.	Douanes division commerce	Directeur Général
Camora, M.	OGUIB	Directeur général adjoint, Division statistiques.
Condé Karinka, M	Douanes	Directeur regional
Coulibaly, Mamoudou	Delmas SDV	Responsable commercial
Diallo, M.	OGUIB	Division statistiques assistant technique
Diallo, Aliou Nadhel	CFZ/EPIC/PGRF	Directeur Général
Hsu Chih-Liang Luc	SODEFA/Forêt Forte	Directeur commercial
Keita, M.	Douanes DISA	Directeur
Keita, Moustapha	OGUIB	Directeur Général
Pallisco, Evelyne		Expert Local
Petit, Jean-Marie	Forêt Forte Nzérékoré	Directeur Usine
Piergrossi, A.S.	Délégation Commission Européenne Guinée	Chef de delegation
Primot, Sophie	Délégation Commission Européenne Guinée	Chargée du programme développement rural
Sagno, Kourama Christine	Ministère de l'Environnement et des Eaux et	Directrice nationale

	Forêts	
Serrada, Olga	Douanes	Directrice générale
Traoré, M.	OGUIB	Division statistiques assistant technique
Traoré, Mohamed Lanakan	Ministère de l'Environnement et des Eaux et Forêts	Chef division législation forestières
Treitein, Tito	Forêt Forte Conakry	Directeur export
<b>Ivory Coast</b>		
Adingra, Colonel Chantal	Direction de la Planification et de l'Evaluation (Ministère de l'Environnement et des Eaux et Forêts) DEPE	Directrice
Adingra, M. Joel	SMCI	Assistant du Directeur Général
Ahimin, Olivier	GNT-CI	Directeur de projet
Anoble, Felx M.	ANIMEX sarl	Directeur Général
Apata, Gustave M.	Direction de l'Informatique, des Statistiques et des Archives	Directeur DISA
Arrion, Michel	Délégation de l'Union européenne en Côte d'Ivoire	Chef de la Délégation
Bamba Boakary Siriki	Port de San Pedro	Responsable pré & post Acheminement
Bessenda, M	Sodefor Daloa	Chef de district
Birkenmaier, Wilfried	SPIB	Président
Bourdoncle, Karine	CIB-SIFCI-SOFIDEX	Gérante
Coulibaly, Souleymane	SENBCI	Président
Diallo, Désiré	Port de San Pedro	Directeur Général
Elloh, Colonel	SODEFOR	Directeur Général Adjoint
Gadji, Abraham	Université d'Abidjan	Consultant local
Gardenal, Philippe	Tranchivoire	Directeur Général
Gbanzaï O. Maurice	SEPBA	Responsable administrative
Gueu, Gilles	African industries	Assistant du Directeur Général
Khochman, Salim	SISTB	Directeur Général
Larché, Fabien	Inprobois	Responsable commercial
Lhoest, Jean Marc	SEPBA	Directeur Général
Longenie, Dr. Francis	ONG Afrique Nature	Internationale Expert
Muraille, Bénérice	Délégation de l'Union européenne en Côte d'Ivoire	Chargée du programme développement rural
N'Goran, Gnamien	Direction générale de la Douane (ne pas été rencontré.	Directeur Général Problème de disponibilité)
Ober, Frédéric	DLH Côte d'Ivoire SA	Directeur Général
Oualo, Colonel	Direction de la Production des Industries Forestières) DPIF	Directeur
Pintière, Sébastien Thomas de la	Délégation de la commission Européenne	Attaché
Rondeau, Guy	ONG Afrique Nature Internationale	Directeur
Seka, Lieutenant Seka	Direction de la Production des Industries Forestières) DPIF	Sous-directeur
Servant, Jacques	Inprobois	Directeur
Singh, M.	Singh SA	Directeur

Tanoh, Capitaine	A.K.A. Direction de la Production des Industries Forestières) DPIF	Sous-directeur
Tropini, Riccardo	Tropical bois	Directeur Général
Ubra, M	Covalma, haut Sassandra	Chef d'exploitation
<b>Liberia</b>		
Adewumi, Adewuyi	UN Mission in Liberia	Civil Affairs Expert
Brownell, Alfred	Green Advocates	
Buku, William	Ministry of Finance	Senior Collector, Freeport Customs
Duo, Sam	Toetown customs	
Golmo, Adala M.	Forest Development Authority	
Gorpudolo, Moses G.	Forest Development Authority	Manager Chain-of-Custody
Gweana, John	Forest Development Authority	
Horton, Emmanuel M.	National Port Authority	Port Manager, Freeport of Monrovia
Jenner, Martin	EC Delegation Liberia	Head of Operations
Jonathan Yiah	SDI	
Kotio, Alfred	Forest Development Authority	Commercial Department
Kpanan'AYoung Siakor,	Silas Sustainable Development Institute	Director
Mosenene, Letla	FFI	
Mulbeh, Peter	SADS (Skill & Agricultural Dev. Service)	
Nyahn, Robert	SAMFU (Save My Future Fund)	
Odoum, Francis	IUCN	
Pichet, Thomas	SGS	Business Development Manager
Simpson, Bob	US Forest Service	USFS
Suaa, Daniel	Timber broker	
Toe, Charles	Toetown customs	
Vaye, Menleh	Chainsaw logger	
Yiah, Jonathan	Sustainable Developmnet Institute	SDI
Zwuen, Sormongar	Sustainable Developmnet Institute	SDI
<b>Nigeria</b>		
Adeleke, Alade	Nigeria Conservation Foundation	
Adeniyi, Wale	Nigeria Customs Service	Public Relations Officer
Afolabi, Amos	Federal Department of Forestry	Acting Director
Dunn, Andrew	Wildlife Conservation Society	Nigeria Representative
Fameso, Mr.	Federal Department of Forestry	Assistant Director
Ibironke Olubamise	Nigeria Conservation Foundation	
Ibol, Dr.	Forestry Commission Cross River State	
Inahoro, Alhaji Ibrahim	Nigeria Conservation Foundation	Coordinator SE Region
Isace, Fajimola	Nigeria Customs Service	Acting Controller
Jenkins, Peter	Drill Ranch	
Marx, Veronique	EC Delegation Nigeria	Project Officer
Oates, Prof. John	City University New York	
Odu Agbor, Dr. Chris	Forestry Commission Cross River State	Permanent Secretary
Olu, Mr.	Golden Seal	Production Manager
Onyekwere, Onyi	Right Edge	Coordinator Factory Operations
Plas, Daniel	EC Delegation Nigeria	First secretary
Pouakouyou, Daniel	FFI	

Sako, Dr. Jimoh	Ibadan university	
Sam, Ubi	Afi Mt Wildlife Sanctuary	
Taiye Ikuejamoye	Twins Omotore & Co.	Timber trader
The Manager	Nigeria Wood Preservation Co., Lagos	
Timber Trader	Akim Timber Market, Calabar	
Timber Trader	Ebute Timber Market, Lagos	
Tony, Mr.	Concern Universal	
<b>Sierra Leone</b>		
Adelino, Nicolau	Portimber Enterprises	
Allden, Hans	EC Delegation Sierra Leone	Head of Delegation
Amadu Lahai, James	Friends of the Earth	
Athkay, Bartholemew	MAFFS, Forestry Division	Director
Bangui, Osman	Ministry of Trade & Industry	Senior Assistant Secretary
Bano, Bah	Portimber Enterprises	
Banya, Dr. Sama	Sierra Leone Conservation Society	Chairman
Bappie, Augustine	ACOTIDA	
Barry, Alan	ACOTIDA	President
Blanshard, Nathaniel	Friends of the Earth	
Conteh, Michael	National Revenue Authority	Assistant Commissioner
Finnoh, A.B.	National Revenue Authority	Deputy Commissioner
Gboko, Chief Aruna	Kenema Chiefdom	
James, S. Inah.	National Revenue Authority	Collector of Customs & Excise
Koruma, A.P.	Sierra Leone Conservation Society	Ex-Chief Conservator
Lahai, Samu	Friends of the Earth	
Macauley, Belmont	Friends of the Earth	
Olatunde, Johnson	Friends of the Earth	Executive Director
Rahall, Joseph	Green Scenery	Executive Director
Ruesing, Matthias	EC Delegation Sierra Leone	Head of Rural Development Section
Sengarie, Abdullai	ACOTIDA	
Siaffa, D.D.	Sierra Leone Conservation Society Executive	Director
<b>Togo</b>		
Adjaho, Koffi	VIMA	Directeur Général
Adjallah, Rogatien	ATOCPEF	Président
Adjima, Jules	Les Compagnons Ruraux ONG	Directeur
Agbayizato, Akadri Elois	CHALLENGES ONG	Directeur
Agbenda, Amana	Direction de l'Informatique, des statistiques douanières, de la comptabilité et du Budget/ Direction Générale des Douanes/ Ministère des Finances et Inspection des Douanes, des Privatisations, et de l'Administration des Douanes,	Directeur
Akakpo, Adjoa Thérèse	ONG La Colombe	Directrice
Akakpo, Guetou M.	COMET ONG	Président
Akakpo, Vignihou J.	CONGREMA ONG	Directeur
Amagadje, Mawuli komi	Global lead	Directeur
Amegadze, Kokou	ADT – TOGO et CCOJ ONG	Directeur
Amegah, Kossi Dodji	ASD –TOGO ONG	Directeur
Amegnignou, Koami François	AJE – TOGO ONG	Directeur
Amouzou, Deborah	AUDACE – DFICO	Secrétaire

Amouzou, Tofa Sam	FONGTO	Président
Ayi, Yawo	TA SYTREBACT	
Chaussi, Aliassou	Administration Forestière et Environnementale du Port	Responsable Autonome de Lomé
Comlan, Koffi	Président des Importateurs du bois d'œuvre	
Dagbovi, Affiwa	SYTREBACT Conseillère	
Dansrou, Kodjo	S. G. SYTREBACT	
Djenda, Aristide	UONGTO ONG	Directeur
Dzogbedo, Agbenyi	ADT –TOGO	Directeur
Guelly, Kudzo Atsu	Université de Lomé/Global Lead	Enseignant chercheur/consultant
Hunlede, Koué	Agricultural Services (Collateral Management)	Manager SGS-TOGO S.A.
Iroko, Basile	Union des Transporteurs de Bois	Directeur
Iroko, Kossi	DOAKPEH – TRANS	Dirrecteur
Iroko, Wolou	Union des Transporteurs de Bois	
Johnson, Ablamba A.	REJED – TOGO ONG	Directeur
Kassehin, K. Mensah	ONG CAD1 -TOGO membre de UONGTO	Directeur
Klogo, Koffi	APGA ONG	Directeur
Kodjo, Agbessinou	S. G. SYNAST	
Kokou, Kouami	Université de Lomé /Global Lead	Consultant local
Komake, Dosseh	SYTREBACT	Chargé d'éducation ouvrière
Koudouvo, Koffi	SYTREBACT	Invité
Kougbenya, Kossi	S. A. TJC – TOGO ONG	Directeur
Kougblenou, Yaovi Edouard	TMB, Ingénieur Bois (ENSTIB –France)	Responsable Production
Kponyo, Peace D. Abia	Ministère du Commerce de l'Industrie de l'Artisanat et des	Conseillère Technique Petites et Moyennes Entreprises
Legay, Denis	Délégation de la Commission Européenne Togo	Chargé développement Rural
Maillot, Yves	SDV – TOGO; Groupe Bolloré	Directeur Transit
Melo de Sampaio, J.	Délégation de la Commission Européenne Togo	Chargé d'affaires
Modzi, Komi Mawuko	ONG / ATPH	Directeur
Nadjombe	ATOCPEF	Vice-Président
Olou-Adara Salifou	Union des Transporteurs de Bois	
Pekpe, Yawo Michel	Douanes Togolaises	Inspecteur Principal des Douanes
Ravizza, Gabriele	TOGO BOIS S.A. ; Membre du National Wood Flooring	Directeur Général Association
Samah, Salman Faris	ATTAC -TOGO et CCOJ ONG	Directeur
Seniou, Djaro	UONGTO ONG	Directeur
Single, Jérémie	Direction de l'Informatique, des Statistiques douanières	Directeur
Soga, Yawo	ONG CVA GREEN-TOGO membre de COMET	Directeur
Teou, Victoire	Hermovic	
Todzro, Mensah	RIOD –TOGO	Directeur
Vonor, Koami	ALTERNATIVES	Directeur



# African Forest Forum



Contact us at:

African Forest Forum

P.O. Box 30677-00100 Nairobi GPO KENYA

Tel: +254 20 722 4203 Fax: +254 20 722 4001

[www.afforum.org](http://www.afforum.org)

